

# **MINUTES OF THE 3RD MEETING OF THE GOVERNING BOARD OF THE PANDEMIC FUND**

December 12-13, 2022

1. The third meeting of the Governing Board of the Pandemic Fund was held virtually on December 12-13, 2022.<sup>1</sup> The Meeting was chaired by Dr. Chatib Basri, Co-Chair of the Governing Board. Dr. Basri thanked the Board and Secretariat for their hard work. He highlighted progress made across several fronts, including with : branding (the Pandemic Fund’s new name and logo); staffing up of the Secretariat; additional resources pledged, signing of contribution agreements, and transfer of resources to the Pandemic Fund; the formation of the Technical Advisory Panel (TAP); and the work of the three technical Working Groups on the Results Framework, Project-level co-financing and co-investment, and first Call for Proposals.

2. Dr. Basri drew attention to the strong support for the Pandemic Fund from G20 Leaders and Finance and Health Ministers at their meetings in Bali last month, noting that this was accompanied by a sense of urgency for the Fund to start delivering and demonstrating tangible results so that the world is better prepared for the next pandemic. Sharing his key takeaways from those meetings, he noted: a) the G20’s appreciation for the collective action that the Pandemic Fund represented, the record speed at which the Fund had been set up, for its robust and inclusive structure that is grounded in the spirit of shared responsibilities needed to address PPR, and for its commitment to transparency and accountability; b) a recognition of the unique role of the Pandemic Fund, as the first, dedicated multilateral financing mechanism for strengthening PPR in low- and middle-income countries; c) a focus on the need for the Pandemic Fund to play a truly catalytic role; and d) a strong expectation for the Fund to deliver fast and start demonstrating impact, and consequently, the need for a pragmatic approach to the first Call for Proposals. He emphasized that the first Call was an opportunity to learn, and that subsequent rounds of financing for projects would provide opportunities to apply those lessons and adjust, as needed.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Board comprises decision-making (voting) participants, referred to as “Members” or “Board Members”; non-voting participants; and Observers.

## **I. ITEMS FOR DECISION (VOTING MEMBERS ONLY)**

### **Co-Chair appointment process following the departure of Dr. Daniel Ngamije**

3. Board Members were informed by Dr. Basri of the decision of Dr. Daniel Ngamije to resign from his role as Co-Chair of the Pandemic Fund Board after having stepped down from his position as Health Minister of Rwanda. Members expressed appreciation of Dr. Ngamije's leadership and hard work. After considering options, and in recognition of the limited time available to select a new Co-Chair, Members requested Dr. Basri to serve as sole Board Chair until the Board reset in May 2023. Dr. Basri agreed to this request from Members.

### **Election of the Vice-Chair of the Technical Advisory Panel (TAP)**

4. Members considered the five candidates nominated for the role of the TAP Vice-Chair and elected Dr. Joy St. John, Executive Director of the Caribbean Public Health Agency, as the TAP Vice-Chair.

## **II. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION AND AGREEMENTS REACHED**

### **Update from the TAP Chair**

5. Dr. Mike Ryan, Executive Director of the WHO's Health Emergencies Program, who was appointed by the Board last month as the TAP Chair, updated the Board on progress with respect to the formation of the TAP. He welcomed Dr. St. John as TAP Vice-Chair. Further, he noted that a Selection Panel chaired by himself and comprising three members nominated by the Board, with support from the health technical team of the Pandemic Fund Secretariat, had begun reviewing the 300+ applications from candidates interested in serving as TAP experts. He informed the Board that, with the participation of the newly elected TAP Vice-Chair, the Selection Panel would submit the shortlist of TAP experts in mid- January 2023 for the Board's approval.

### **Update from the Secretariat and Trustee**

6. Dr. Priya Basu, Executive Head of Secretariat, introduced the new members of the Secretariat team and shared highlights of the successful Pandemic Fund launch event that took place on the margins of the G20 Joint Finance and Health Ministers meeting in Bali, Indonesia on November 13, 2022. The event was inaugurated by President Widodo of Indonesia, with introductory remarks by World Bank Group President Mr. David Malpass, the WHO Director General Dr. Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus, Indonesia's Finance Minister Dr. Sri Mulyani

Indrawati, and World Bank Managing Director for Operations Dr. Axel van Trotsenburg. The event included a high-level panel featuring United States Secretary of the Treasury Dr. Janet Yellen, Italy's Minister of Economy & Finance Mr. Giancarlo Giorgetti, China's Vice-Minister of the National Health Commission Dr. Cao Xuetao, Co-Chair of the Pandemic Fund's Board and former Finance Minister of Indonesia Dr. Chatib Basri, World Bank MDO Dr. Axel van Trotsenburg, India's Secretary for Health and Family Welfare Mr. Rajesh Bhushan, and Deputy Director General for Economic and Financial Affairs at the European Commission, Ms. Elena Flores. Indonesia's Health Minister Mr. Budi Sadikin closed the event.

7. Further, she noted the additional contribution of AUD35 million announced at that event by the Australian Treasurer Mr. Jim Chalmers and the pledge announced by the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia at the G20 Leaders' Summit. She informed the Board that, since the last Board meeting in October, three donors (France, India, and the Netherlands) had joined the Board by signing contribution agreements.

8. In brief statements to the Board, Ms. Anne-Claire Amprou, France's Global Health Ambassador, noted that France had joined the Germany-Spain constituency; Mr. Joris Jurriens, Head of Global Health, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands shared that the Netherlands had joined the Canada-Norway constituency. Mr. Rajeev Topno, Senior Advisor to the Executive Director at the World Bank noted that India was discussing options; following the meeting, the Board was informed that India had been invited to join the Indonesia-UAE constituency.

9. The Board was informed that, in response to a request for additional support from Civil Society Organizations (CSO) Members, the following CSO representatives would be providing support to the CSO Global South and Global North Board Members, respectively: Dr. Diah Saminarsih (CISDI), Ms. Lizzie Otake (EANNASO), Mr. Ah Maftuchan (PRAKARSA), and Ms. Linda Oduor (Oxfam International) to support the CSO Global South Board Members, and Ms. Courtney Carson (Pandemic Action Network), Ms. Ashley Arabasadi (ResearchAmerica), and Ms. Courtenay Howe (Platform for ACT-A CS and Community Representatives) to support the CSO Global North Board Members.

10. Further, the Secretariat provided brief updates on the preparation of the Conflicts of Interest Framework, noting that it would be circulated to the Board for comments by the end of the week (the draft was subsequently circulated), and on the Accreditation Framework for the inclusion of additional implementing entities, which would be circulated to the Board for comments by end-December 2022.

11. In his update, Mr. Darius Stangu from the Trustee office informed the Board that, as of December 12, 2022, total pledges amounting to US\$1.57 billion had been announced to the

Pandemic Fund by 25 donors. Further, it was noted that currently available resources in the Pandemic Fund amounted to US\$487.1 million (equiv.) and that indicative expected resources by February 28, 2023, would be at US\$ 519.93 million (equiv.).

## **Results Framework**

12. Dr. Michael Mahar, Associate Director of Global Health Security at the United States CDC, who chaired the technical Working Group (WG) on the Pandemic Fund's Results Framework, presented the WG's Outcomes document that had been shared with the Board prior to the meeting.<sup>2</sup>

13. Members agreed to the four elements of the proposed Results Framework (building capacity/demonstrating capability; fostering coordination among countries globally and regionally and across sectors within countries; incentivizing additional investments in PPR; and ensuring administration/operational efficiency of PF resources). They expressed support for periodic reviews/revisions of the Framework and agreed on a time frame wherein the WG would deliver the draft Framework by January 16, 2023, for review by the TAP, and the revised version, incorporating feedback from the TAP Chair and Vice-Chair, would be circulated on January 23, 2023, for Board approval on a "no-objection" basis by end-January, and included in the first Call for Proposals package.

14. In providing specific comments, Members noted the following: a) the Results Framework should serve as an accountability tool, by including ways to identify underperformance and while it should be flexible, it should not change dramatically between calls for proposals, and must touch on sustainability of outcomes; b) the Framework should include ways to measure coordination and cooperation between implementing entities, integration across global health actors and resources already available/working on global health security, and multi-sectorality of investments; and c) the Framework should include a theory of change model for all elements, and a rolled-up figure that shows relationships between all metrics. The WG agreed to incorporate this feedback in the next draft and to review and reflect, as appropriate, comments that had been provided by the Implementing Entities.

## **Co-financing and co-investment**

15. Ms. Eleonora Mei from the Ministry of Economy and Finance, Italy, who chaired the technical WG on project-level co-financing and co-investment, presented the

---

<sup>2</sup> Working Group Participants included: Antonis Lanaras (EC); Alice Jamieson (Philanthropies); Sangkyun, Han (ROK); Thorsten Behrendt (Germany); Weifeng Yang-China MoF; Marnie Davidson (Canada); Nitish Debnath (CSOs); Bolanle Oyeledun (Co-investors).

recommendations contained in the WG's Outcomes document that had been shared in advance of the meeting.<sup>3</sup>

16. The Board expressed support for the WG's recommendations, noting that co-financing and co-investment will reinforce the Pandemic Fund's ability to serve as a catalyst. The Board agreed on the importance of developing an updated co-financing and co-investment policy after the first Call for Proposals, integrating the principles of the current document and the lessons from the first Call.

17. Members agreed with the WG's principles-based approach to country co-investment, which recognizes that varying circumstances across potential beneficiary countries do not support establishing a uniform set of strict co-investment requirements. At the same time, Members agreed with the WG's recommendation for Pandemic Fund - financed projects to demonstrate country commitment, including financial and policy-based commitments, as appropriate. It was agreed that, in the spirit of the catalytic nature of the Pandemic Fund, projects should seek to mobilize co-financing from Implementing Entities as well as from other relevant technical partners.

18. Members asked that the above considerations, along with comments provided by the Implementing Entities, be built into the design of the first Call for Proposals as well as the updated co-financing and co-investment policy to be developed after the first Call for Proposals.

## **First Call for Proposals**

19. Ms. Sue Graves, Deputy Director for Health Funds and Architecture at the Gates Foundation, who chaired the technical WG on the first Call for Proposals, provided an update based on the WG's Outcomes document that had been shared in advance of the meeting.<sup>4</sup>

20. Members supported the WG's proposal to focus the first Call for proposals on the 'Detect' portion of the Joint External Evaluation (JEE) tool, specifically on surveillance, laboratory capacity, and human resources, while providing flexibility within those categories. Some Members noted the need for future calls to include priorities beyond the 'Detect' category of the JEE. Furthermore, Members endorsed the proposed assessment criteria and prioritization

---

<sup>3</sup> Working Group Participants included: Kristine Husoy (Norway), Beth Cameron (US), Lydia Boudarene (EC), Kentaro Ogata (Japan), Manisha Bhinge (Philanthropies), Bonanza Taihito (Indonesia), Jackline Kiarie (CSOs), Dominique Baabo Kubuya (Co-investors).

<sup>4</sup> The participants of this WG included: Weifeng Yang (China), Elisha Dunn-Georgiou (CSOs), Nina Miltzer (Germany), Eleonora Mei (Italy), Kentaro Ogata (Japan), Stephanie Williams (Australia), Bolanle Oyeledun (Co-investors), and Arjun Vasan (US).

principles with support for inclusion of an additional assessment criteria addressing gender and human rights considerations. On the resource envelope for the first Call for Proposals, several Members expressed concern that the proposed \$420 million was too large and that it should be reduced to allow more funding for future calls. No specific alternative number was proposed.

21. Much of the Board's discussion focused on the relative merits of alternative approaches to the first Call for Proposals that were presented in the WG's document. In weighing the pros and cons of the two approaches proposed by the WG, Members emphasized the need for a pragmatic approach that encompasses openness and offers the potential to attract solid proposals within a relatively short timeframe that can make an impact. Further, they recognized that the first Call would provide lessons that could be applied to subsequent Calls and that each Call could have a different thematic focus and take a different approach.

22. Based on the above considerations, Members decided that the first Call for Proposals should: a) adopt an inclusive, country-driven approach that would accept single or multi-country proposals covering all eligible countries, prepared along with one or more Implementing Entity; b) demonstrate collaboration and coordination among Implementing Entities, as well as across countries and sectors, as appropriate; and c) demonstrate project-level co-financing from Implementing Entities, given the volume of PPR financing currently held by some Implementing Entities, as well as from other technical partners, along with co-investment from beneficiaries (as noted above).

23. On the process, Members agreed that, to foster coordination among project partners, and to avoid duplication of efforts, the Secretariat should issue an initial call for Expressions of Interest, well before the date by which full proposals are required to be submitted. Further, it was felt that it would be useful for each proposal to be led and coordinated by a Project Leader, preferably from a national agency, who could also serve as a point of contact for the Secretariat.

24. On the timeline, Members agreed that the first Call for Proposals should be launched before end- January 2023. It was noted that adequate time was needed for good proposals to be prepared and that the timeline should take into consideration the fact that some countries are planning to undertake their JEEs in February 2023. Regarding the final allocation of resources under the first Call for Proposals, Members agreed that this should be completed before June 30, 2023. Some Members expressed the view that, in the interest of full closure, it would be preferable to complete the allocation process before the Board is reset in May 2023. The Secretariat agreed to examine options and revert with alternative timelines.

25. As a next step, Members asked the Secretariat to bring together the different aspects of the three WGs into a package of materials for the first Call for Proposals, with inputs and advice from the TAP, and submit it to the Board for approval so that the first Call for Proposals can be launched by end-January 2023.

### **Board confidentiality**

26. It was noted that, in line with the Pandemic Fund's commitment to transparency, Minutes of meetings, along with all documents, once approved and finalized, would be published on the Fund's website. Participants were reminded of the need to maintain confidentiality of the Board's deliberations and the information and documents shared with the Board until such time as documents were disclosed.

### **Board Calendar**

27. It was agreed that the next meeting would be held virtually before the end of January 2023 to approve the Call for Proposals package. An in-person Board retreat (with provisions for remote participation) would be organized in March. The date of the subsequent meeting would be determined by the timetable for the allocation of resources under the first Call for Proposals. Following its reset in May 2023, the new Board would need to meet towards the end of May. After that, the next meeting would be in October 2023, at which the Board would review the first year of the Pandemic Fund's operations. The Secretariat agreed to circulate a revised Board calendar for 2023.

### **Conclusion and Next Steps**

28. In conclusion, Dr. Basri thanked participants for a very productive meeting. Reiterating his appreciation to Dr. Mike Ryan and Dr. Joy St. John for agreeing to serve as TAP Chair and Vice-Chair, respectively, he noted that he was looking forward to the TAP being fully constituted and operational in January 2023. On the first Call for proposals, he asked the Secretariat to bring together the different aspects of the three WGs and inputs from the TAP to develop the package for the Board's approval by end-January 2023, reflecting the agreements reached at the meeting. He reminded contributors that as they sign their contribution agreements between now and April 2023, they should work to determine the Board constituencies that they would be joining. Finally, he reminded Co-investor Members and CSO Members that they should start working on a self-selection process to decide on representation for a two-year period, starting with the Board reset in May 2023.